46. Akola Gramin Bank, Akola (Maharashtra).

47. Surat Bharuch Gramin Bank, Bharuch (Gujarat).

[Placed in Library. For (1) to (47) See No. LT—1286 to 1332/901

THE FAMILY COURTS (AMENDMENT) BILL, 1990

THE MINISTER OF STEEL AND MINES WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI): Madam, I move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Family Courts Act, 1984.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Madam, 1 introduce the Bill.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, I want to raise a very important matter that has happened in Tamil Nadu.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: 1 will allow. Just a minute. The Leader ot the Opposition is on his legs. I think I should give him preference. Yes, Leader of the Opposition.

ALLEGED INTERFERENCE WITH THE JUDICIAL PROCESS IN THE SYED MODI MURDER CASE

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): Madam, I would like to bring to your notice and through you to the notice of this House and the nation, the blatant interference with the judicial process which threatens the rule of ia_w and the fabric of our democracy. Madam, it has been reported in the newspapers that in the Syed Modi murder case the CBI had engaged three counsel, the main counsel being Mr. Samant and the other two assisting counsel. All the three counsel were changed just on the eve when the chargesheet was to be framed today, at such an occasion when on the other side, on behalf of the defence, an array of formidable lawyers including Mr. Ram Jethmalani who is the Member of this House, were ranged. The competent lawyers were sought to be removed. Of course, at a later stage when it was brought to the notice of the Prime Minister they have been reinstated. I would also bring to the notice of this House that just on such an occasion a yery eminent Sessions Judge, Mr. I. S. Mathur, who was handling the case has been transferred to the Institute of Judicial Training and Research as a District and Sessions Judge and a new gentleman has been posted by name Mr. Pradhan, who is going to retire in about a month and halfs time. It is such a person wiio has been brought. All these actions, I would like to submit, smack of mala fides. A person who is"the relation of the Prime Minister, they should have taken more scare about him. Madam, where a person is a relation of the Prime Minister, what impression do you give to the world? What impression do you give to the country? You give the impression that there will not be a fair trial in this case for such a heinous offence of murder. What impression are **you** giving to the country? That is why I would like to bring to the notice of this House that— we do not know— it is said that when once it came to the notice of the Prime Minister, he directed that all those lawyers must be reinstated and they should continue. But we would like to know what action is going to be taken against those who were responsiDle for the removal of these lawyers because some action must be taken against such people. To m-e, it smacks of an impression: shuold we believe that the removal could take place without the knowledge of the Prime Minister himself, withouT the knowledge of the Home Minister?

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): It cannot happen.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: These are the questions which are para-

[Shri P. Shiv Shanker] mount in the minds of many people. What assurance the Government would like to give about the fair trial of the case? In fact such a trial should not have taken place at Lucknow itself. It should have taken place at a different place so that people should know that the course of justice would not be sullied in any manner. Therefore," I would like that Government give clear assurances about the questions that I have raised.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra!: The Law Minister is here. Let him get up and say something. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, with a heavy heart, I wish to raise.. . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: If the Home Minister... *(Interruptions)* We would very much like if the Prims Minister gives an assurance in this matter.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : प्रधान मंत्री जी वक्तव्य दें।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्य प्रदेश) : बहुत गम्भीर मामला है।

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): It is a sorry state of affair's... Let the Prime Minister come and make a statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Home Minister wants to say something. . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: When the allegations has been made by the Leader of the Opposition, let not the Home Minister reply to if. Let the Prime Minister come aria say.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Home Minister.. .*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated); I want to say something... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Whatever *Mr.* Shiv Shanker said, the whole 'louse heard it. If the Hon»e Minister wants to respond to It, you listen to him also. He has the right to speak..... Please taKe your seats. Let there be calm. He made his point. Vou wanted the Government to react. Now If Government is reacting, yoa can react to it later, but not now.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): We want reaction from the Prime Minister.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: It is a matter which involves the Prime Minister of the country and we have a right to... *i*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Madam, regretfully, all types of rumours are floating. It is being said that Mr. Pradhan is going to be elevated to the High Court. That is why we would like to request that, since this matter is dealt with by the Department of Personnel, the Prime Minister gives a clear assurance.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैडम, प्रधान मंत्री को बुलवाइये। वह स्टेटमेंट दें। उनके दामाद का मामला है। प्रधान मंत्री ने सारे देश को* किया है।...(व्यवधान) धिक्कार है। सदन में आकर के विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह ने...(व्यवधान)

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR (Uttar Pradesh): Madam/on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; What is the point of order?

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR: I will just explain in one minute. *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Mr. Fotedar, you should know tnat according to rules there should be some matter under discussion and then only a Member can raise a point of order. At the moment there is no matter under discussion before the House, ... *(Interruptions)*... I allowed... *(Interruptions),..* Just a minute; take your seat. Don't get agitated. I am abiding by the rules. There is no matter "under discussion before the House. Mr. Shiv Shanker raised an

♦Expunged as wdered by the Chair.

issue—that is a different thing—and the Minister is reacting. There is no point of order. Please take your seat.

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR: Madam, just listen. The very fact that you have permited the Leader of the Opposition to raise a point for discussion means I have the right to raised a point of order.. . *(Interruptions)*.. .

THE. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no point of order. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MAKHAN LAL, FOTEDAR: On a point of information.. . *(Inter-ruptinos).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; There is nothing like a point of information in the Rule Book. There is only point of order, and I am strictly abiding by the rules.» Please take your seat and let the Minister speak.

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR: 1 am also abiding by the rules and by the order of the Chair. Since you have permitted . ..*(Interruptions).* .. You just listen and then rule it out. Since you have permitted the Leader of the Opposition to raise an issue in the House and make an allegation or aspersion or a charge against the person of the Prime Minister himself that his son-in-law is involved, we would like that the Prime Minister himself reply. That is the point. .. . *(Inttrruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is not point of order....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY; Let the Prime Minister come... *(Interrup tions).* .. We want the Prime Minister to answer all the points raised by the Leader of the Opposition_____ *(Inter ruptions)*... Madam, it is concerning the Prime Minister: let the Prime Minister come ..... *(Interruptions)*....

गृह मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री सुबोध कान्त सहाय) : माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैं सदन को बताना चाहता हूं... (व्यवधान)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Let the Prime Minister come. We don't want the Minister of State to answer.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The responsibility of the Government is joint. Let the Minister have his say.

.... *(Interruptions)* -------- Please take your seat ------ *(Interruptions).*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Let the Prime Minister come .....(Inter ruptions) ....

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY): Madam____

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Let the Minister come .....*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please allow the Leader of the House to speak. (Interruptions) Please have patience.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI; When is the Prime Minister coming?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; I cannot answer when the Prime Minister is coming. It is for the Government to answer. Let him speak. *(Interruptions)*... Sit down, please.

LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY): Madam Deputy Chairman, I am grateful to the Members—I am grateful to you all—for having observed some pati. ence. Madam, my point is, Shiv Shankerji, as the Leader of the Opposition, has raised an issue. You have permitted him to raise the issue and he has raised it, and while raising the issue he has made Some observations and he expected some reaction from the Government r.ide.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: From the Prime Minister!... *(Interruptions)* ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is your opinion. Let him give his opinion. .. . *(Interruptions)*.. .

श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) महोदया . . . (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; All right. Let him have his say.

SHRl V. NARAYANASAMY: It is a case against the Prime Minister's son-in-law being involved in a murder case.... *(Interruptions),..*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I say, don't bring in the relations. Take your seat.

श्री राम नरेश यादव : प्रधान मंत्री जो स्टेटमेंट दें, क्योंकि यह सारा मामला उनसे संबंधित है ।...(व्यवधान) वह जिम्मेदार हैं ।...(व्यवधान) इसलिए प्रधान मंत्री जी को आना चाहिए और सदन को बताना चाहिए ।

उपसभापति : आप जरा बैठ जाइये । ...(व्यवधान) मैं आपसे विनती करती हूं कि आप बैठ जाइये । देखिए, आपने शिव शंकर जी ने अपनी बात कही है हाउस में दूसरों को भी अपनी बात कहने का हक है । आप बैठ जाइये ।...(व्यवधान) Please don't interrupt, I request you not to interrupt. I didn't allow anybody to interrupt Shri Shiv Shanker, and I will not allow anybody to interrupt the Leader of the HouSe, I am very clear about it. Please take your seat. Plaese allow me to function the House properly. *{Interruptions)* इस पर डिसकशन नहीं है. मैं किसी को नहीं बुलाऊंगी ।

SHRl M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, you have allowed my colleague, the Minister of Home Affairs, to reply to whatever observations he has made. It is not for the Opposition to insist that A or B or C on behalf of the Government should reply on any issue. You cannot insist that. The Government has got to reply. *{Interruptions)*

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: The Prime Minister is involved in it. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: When you were in the Opposition you insisted that the Prime Minister should come and reply. Don't forget those days. We want the Prime Minister to come and reply. *(Interruptions)*

M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let me make it very clear. The Government is responsible to the House. On behalf of the Government any Minister can reply to the debate or give clarification on any issues. Let it be understood. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Let Mr. V. P. Singh come to answer the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Only Prime Minister. *(Interruptions)*

श्री सुबोध कान्त सहाय : उपसभापति महोदया, मैं बताना चाहता हूं, माननीय शिव शंकर जी ने जो कहा है, मैं इज्जत करता हूं माननीय शिव शंकर जी की, जो कि उन्होंने यह सवाल उठाया । उनके द्वारा उठाए ये सवाल थे कहीं न कहीं... (व्यवधान) एक चुनौती हैं । ...(व्यवधान) उसके बारे में मैं कहना चाहता हूं । (व्यवधान) इस तरह के लोग...(व्यवधान) आप बैठ जाइये, मैं जवाब देना चाहता हूं । सरकार जवाब देना चाहती है । अगर आपको ..(व्यवधान) हम अन्याय को राजनीति में शामिल नहीं होने देंगे । ...(व्यवधान) मैं कहना चाहता हूं उपसभापति महोदया, यह सरकार ने 9 अगस्त को ...(व्यवधान) आप माननीय सदस्य हल्ला करने के लिए यहां हैं ।...(व्यवधान) आप हल्ला कीजिए, जितना हल्ला करना चाहते हैं, कर लीजिए, उसके बाद ही हम जवाब देंगे । 9 अगस्त को सरकार ने फैसला किया कि ...(व्यवधान) पैसे में कटौती को ले करके ...(व्यवधान) और उसी के तहत जब... (व्यवधान) को टर्मीनेट किया गया । लेकिन मैं कहना चाहता हूं (व्यवधान)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam Deputy Chairman, I want to make a submission. When you allowed the Leader of the Opposition to raise a point, we heard him with rapt attention and really he raised that point through you not only to draw the attention of the Members of this House, but also, through this House, the attention of the nation. This is what I could note from his particular words. And the *prima facie* charge which he has made is very serious that there has been an attempt—whether successful or unsuccessful, that is a different

matter—to interfere with the despensation of justice. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Please, don't interrupt, I would allow everybody to speak. At least don't interrupt. And I will allow the Minister also to speak. It is for your information. So, please don't interrupt.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: So, it is a very serious charge. In a country like ours if there is a charge coming from an opposition that an attempt is being made on the part of the ruling front or the ruling party to interfere with the working of the independent judiciary, it is really a serious charge. Obviously we belong to this House representing certain political parties—mySelf, Vajpayee Ji and others—and we are entitled to know what is happening. We have heard the charge, we have heard the complaint, but we are not being allowed to know what the reply to the charge is. We are very much entitled to know because we have got accountability to the people and to the nation. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Mr. V. P; Singh should come to the House. *(Interruptions)* Then only we will get the reply.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Allow him to Speak. He is a Member of the House and he has a right to speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If the right of the judiciary you are highlighting, I have to hear and to make out my point of View.

AN HON. MEMBER: We want to hear from the Prime Minister's mouth.

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY; The Prime Minister has misused his office.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: All right, we know. Any word coming from anybody's mouth may not justify that action, may not convince me. It is not a person from whose mouth the word is coming out.. . *(Interruptions)* . . As I could understand from the statement made by the Leader of the Opposition, in an exercise, in an attempt to interfere with the judiciary, the lawyers on behalf of the CBI on the eve of the case to be heard their services were terminated. This is one item. But, at the same time, the Leader of the Opposition has stated that the moment it went to the notice of the Prime Minister, the Prime Minister himself had ordered for reinstatement of those lawyers... *(Interruptions).,.* This is what I could hear from you.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: It has come in the newspapers.

SHRl DIPEN GHOSH; So they were reinstated. There is another charge that the trial Judge has been transferred and a new Judge has been appointed to try the case and the Judge who is just on the eve of retirement... *(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dinesh Goswami after he speaks you can explain because it is a matter... *(Interruptions) ...*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: From this—as a Member of the House, it appears to me —I have heard Mr. Shiv Shanker saying that even though the Prime Minister has reinstated those dismissed lawyers what actions are being taken against the officials or against the persons who engineered the dismissal of those lawyers. This is one aspect.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Please be brief. ▮▮▮/▮▮▮: WN

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: So naturally the CBI coming under the Ministry of Home Affairs....

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR: It is under the Prime Minister.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA; It is under the direct control of the Prime Minister... *(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dipen, will you be brief?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We may not agree with the Minister of State for Home Affairs on behalf of the Government what he will be saying. We may not be convinced what he will be saying. But we may try to understand actually what they want to say. We will get an opportunity to know what actually they have got to say about your charge.

[Dipen Ghosh]

The second charge is about the interference with the judiciary, transfer of Judge, etc. The Minister of Law and Justice is here and he can make a statement.

. . *(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Mr. Kesri, if I allow you, I have to allow everybody. We want to close the discus sion. J *1£M!*

SHRI SITARAM KESRI (Bihar); You said that after him you will allow me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to allow many people. If you want a discussion, I have no objection. You take the permission of the Chair. You can ask the Chairman to have a discussion on it. But we want to proceed with the listed business.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH; After raising a Serious charge, the Leader of the Opposition should not really expect the other Members to remain content with listening to making noises or howling. We must know what is happening. It may not convince us, not necessarily their statement will convince us. ... *(Interruptions)* ....

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: . . .Madam, why I said that? *(Interruption)...* It is the Prime Minister who seems to have set the things right. Therefore, I wanted the Prime Minister to Say something. *(Interruption).*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Shiv Shanker, you had been a Minister for a long time. *(Interruptions),*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: The Department of Personnel is under the Prime Minister. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Sitaram Kesri had been a Minister of P irliamen-tary Affairs for a long time Mr. M. M. Jacob was a Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs. Mr. Salve, Mr. Fotedar, Mr. Dubey, all were Ministers. During your ministership, whenever we raised the demand that the Prime MimVer should come and make a statement, did you oblige us ?No. You had never obliged us. Whenever we had asked that the Prime Minister should come and make a statement, eveiy-time, we had heard the same reply that Mr. Gurupadaswamy... *(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Shiv Shanker, I respect you because y)u are the Leader of the Opposition. I allowed you to sweak as Leader of the Opposition. I think, it is in the fitness of things that you allow the Government to say something. *(Interruptions).* Please take your seat. It is not proper for anybody to say who should answer. It Is the collective responsibility whether you may agree or you may not agree. But let the Government say something. *(Interruptions).*

SHRl YASHWANT SINGH (Bihar): Madam, we must get an opportunity. . *(Interruptions).*

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह (बिहार) : यह कोई तरीका नहीं है । हम भी अपनी बात कहना चाहते हैं, हमारी बात भी सुनी जाए । ···(व्यवधान)···

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I have a right to Speak. *(lnttrruptions)* You ask him to sit down. *(Interruption)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. If the Members feel that the matter is very serious.. . *(Interruption).* When I am speaking, you allow me to speak. Are you not going to allow me to speak? I said please. If you feel the matter is serious, then let the Government react to it *(Interruptions)*,

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER; Madam, I have stated the reasons as to why we wanted the Prime Minister. But if the Home Minister wants to speak, let him speak. *(Interruptions)* .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Shiv Shanker, I have been called. Madam, the simple point that I want io make is.. . *[Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not proper. I will not permit. *(Interruptions).* I am telling the hon. Members. Take your seats. Please sit down. I request the Members to take their seats. I am not permitting any noise in thi House. I am not permitting the House to be taken to ransom. Every Member has a right to speak. Let him speak. *(Interruption)*.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, I am appealing to Mr. Shiv Shanker... *(Interruptions).*

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (मध्य प्रदेश) : मेडम, यह क्या हो रहा है ? आपने विरोधी दल के नेता को मौका दिया था। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, .. . *(Interruptions)*.. .day in and day out, Mr. Shiv Shanker is allowed by us to make his statement and not one person from this side interrupts, as happened even today. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You bring the Prime Minister. Let the Prime Minister come here.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I want to tell Mr. Shiv Shanker, with all the. .. *(Interruptions)*.. .at my command that we shall not allow anyone from the Congress Benches to have his say in future. *(Interruptions)* .

SHRI VISHVJIT p SINGH (Maharash tra): Madam, I appeal to you to uphold democracy. • *'W'*

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : वी० पी० सिंह आए और जवाब दे... (व्यवधान)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Then, I want to tell him. .. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him finish.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Then I want to tell him that in future if anybody gets up to speak from those Benches, even if it is Mr. Shiv Shanker. .. *(Interruptions).* They are taking undue advantage of the fact.. . .*(Interruptions).* And if Mr. Shiv Shanker is a party to this conspiracy, then I feel extremely sorry. I have great respect for Mr. Shiv Shanker as the Leader of the Opposition. *(Interruptions).* I want to tell you that this cannot be allowed to go on. So, Madam Deputy Chairman, I would like to say that either Mr. Shiv Shanker. .. *(Interruptions)* .

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : संजय सिंह के ससुर वी० पी० सिंह को बुलाओ... (व्यवधान)

श्री अश्विनी कुमार (बिहार) : महोदया, यह एक सीरियस मामला है इसलिए प्रधान मंत्री को इस संबंध में वक्तव्य देना चाहिए।

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : यह वी०पी० सिंह के दामाद का मामला है। इन्होंने जडिशियरी और सी० बी० आई० को* किया है ...(व्यवधान)

श्री सुबोध कांत सहाय : महोदया, जैसा कि मैं बता रहा था ...(व्यवधान) सरकार ने इस संबंध में फैसला लिया है ...(व्यवधान) इनको न्याय से कोई मतलब नहीं है, राजनीति से मतलब है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon Members, please take your seats. *(Inter ruptions)* . There were certain allegations made on the Judiciary. Now, the Minister for Law is here. I have asked him to speak. "•■•

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: No. We want the Prime Minister. .. *(Interruptions)* .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have asked Mr. Dinesh Goswami to speak. Let us listen to him. *(Interruptions).*

THE MINISTER OF STEEL AND MINES WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI):
Madam, the Leader of the Oppositon has made two allegatons against me and my Ministry,

SOME HON. MEMBERS; No, no, we want Shri V. P. Singh.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: The Prime Minister should come to the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, to the Minister speak first. I will also allow you to speak.. . *(Interruptions)* .. .1 will allow you to speak.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: When the Prime Minister is answering the press, why does he not come here and face the House? Why is he avoiding this House? Why is he not coming to this House?

♦Expunged as ordered, by the,Chair.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Madam, there are two allegations concerning my Ministry... *(Interruptions)* ... Madam, there are two allegations... *(Interrup tions)* . .. r~e

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : *(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is replying.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: .Madam, there are two allegations made by the hon. Leader of the Opposition which concern me and my Ministry.

... (Interruptions)...

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no point of order.

... {Interruptions)...

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Please listen to me. Madam, there are two allegations concerning my Ministry.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : देश बचाओ, वी०पी० सिंह को बुलाओ ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You may agree or you may not agree. Listen to him. As I have allowed Mr. Shitf Shanker to speak, in the same manner, I allow the Minister to speak.

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE: You are only allowing the issue to **be** avoided.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Two allegations concern my Ministry... *(Interruptions)...Please* permit me to speak. Listen to me. ■ *.(Interruptions)* . • -Madam, I am not in the habit of speaking in a House of disorder... *(Interruptions)*. . .What is the difficulty in listening to me? *(Interruptions)* ...;

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you to raise the point of order. You allow the Law Minister to make his point first.. . *(Interruptions)...* Why not?

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: W2 want the Prime Minister.

♦Expunged as ordered by the Chair

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Minister make his point. I will allow you to speak.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: When he is answering the press, why is the Prime Minister not coming and answering us in the House?

उपसभापति : रत्नाकर जी, आप अगर अपनी जगह पर बैठेंगे तो ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: 'I here are two allegations concerning my Ministry.. . *{Interruption)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Kesriji, please sit down. Let him have his say.

SHRI SITARAM KESRI: I honour the Chiar. But I must be allowed to make my submisiion.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow ycu. Let the Law^ Ministe- make his point. *{Interruption)* Would you allow me to speak or not? Kesriji, I will allow you. Let me restore order in the House.

SHRI SITARAM KESRI: You promised to call me after him. But you did not call me. First you should listen to my point.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: The Leader of the Opposition made two charges against my Ministry...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Has the Leader of the Opposition no control over him Members? I want to know. What is happening there? Has he lost control over his Members? Shiv Shankerji, have you lost control over your Members? The intention is very clear. They want to make allegations and then disturb the House.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharash tra): Madam, may I make a submis sion? " jrp

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I Want to draw the attention of the Leader of the Opposition. Has he lost control over his own colleagues?

SHRI SITARAM KESRI: Don't forget the old days. I know what you were doing at that time.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: The Leader of the Opposition has made two allegations against my Ministry...

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : यह तरह-तरह की नारेबाजी और इस तरह की बातें कर रहे हैं, आपसे यह अनुरोध करना चाहता हूं कि सदन की कार्यवाही चलने दी जाये. . . (**व्यवधान**) मैं जनता से कहना चाहता हूं कि भारत के जनतंत्र में यह . . . (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Madam, may I appeal to you?... *{Interruptions)* .. .

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no... .. *.(Interruptions)...*

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Madam, may I request you?... *(Interruptions)*.. .

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. No... .. *.(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Madam, I have a right to reply.. .*(Interruptions)...* 'He has made two points.. . *(Interruptions)* .. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; *yes,* you have a right to reply... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: I have a right to reply to the points Mr. Shiv Shanker has made... *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I may tell the Members that if they do not obey the Chair's ruling. I will have to adjourn the House... *(Interruptions)...* I will adjourn the *Uouse...(Interruptions)* ...I am giving you the warning that if you do not listen to the Minister, I will adjourn the House. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .1 adjourn the House. . , *(Interruptions)* ...

Th© House is adjourned for ten minutes . . . *(Interruptions)...*

The House then adjourned at The House then adjourned at the clock.

The House then adjourned at past one of the clock, The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Madam, I want to raise a very important... (Inter-*ruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you... *(Interruptions)* I said I will you. (Interruptions)

आप पहले मुझे मंत्री जी की बात सुनने दीजिए। मुझे दोनों तरफ की बात सुनने दीजिए । मेरी जिम्मेदारी है कि दोनों तरफ की बात सुन कर अपना निर्णय ले सकती हूं। जब तक मैं गवर्नमेंट की तरफ की बात नहीं सुनूंगी, दिनेश गोस्वामी जी की बात नहीं सुनूंगी, जो मंत्री बोलना चाहते हैं उनकी बात नहीं सुनूंगी तब तक अपना निर्णय एकतरफा कैसे दे सकती हूं ?

श्री सीताराम केसरी : आपने प्रोमिज किया था कि बोलने के लिए पहले बुलायेंगी। उसके बाद उन्हें कहेंगी। आपने यह वायदा किया था। . . . (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra); Madam,.. . *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. *(Interruptions)* At least allow me.. .*(Interruptions)* You are not allowing the Ministers. . . *(Interruptions).*

केसरी जी, मैं आपने वायदे में ही रहूंगी । मैंने शिव शंकर जी की बात सुनी, सारे हाउस ने पूरी शांति से सुनी। मैं सरकार की बात सुनने के बाद ही अपना निर्णय दूंगी ।

श्री सीताराम केसरी : सरकार की बात सुनने के पूर्व, दीपेन घोष के बोलने के बाद, आपने मुझे बोलने के लिए कहा था। इसलिए मैंने निवेदन किया कि मुझे बोलने दीजिए ।

उपसभापति : उस वक्त इतना हंगामा हो रहा था कि आपकी बात सुनी नहीं जा सकती थी ।

श्री सीताराम केसरी : मेरी आवाज तो एकदम आसमान तक जाएगी । आप ध्यान दीजिए, मैंने यही निवेदन किया था कि दीपेन घोष के बाद मुझे बोलने दीजिए। उसके बाद आप जिसको चाहे, बोलने के लिए बुला लीजिए ।

उपसभापति : मगर एक आश्वासन केसरी जी आपको देना पड़ेगा चेयर को कि अगर मैं आपको अलाऊ करूंगी तो

[श्री सीताराम केसरी]

फिर दोनों मंत्रियों की बात सब मेंबर शांति से सुनेंगे। . . (व्यवधान) . . .

श्री सीताराम केसरी : आप पहले सुन लीजिए । . . (व्यवधान) . . आज तक कभी . . (व्यवधान) . .

उपसभापति : I am not allowing you to speak. (*Interruptions*)

देखिए क्या हो रहा है । आप देखिए । . . . (व्यवधान) . . . मैंने आपसे यह बात कही कि मैं आपको अलाऊ करती हूं, पर आप फिर इन दोनों मंत्रियों की बात शांति से सुनिए। आप तैयार हैं ?

SHRI M. VINCENT (Tamil Nadu): Madam, there is a move to liquidate the Anna D.M.K. Party.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Don't come here. Don't put it on the Table. Take it away from the Table. You can't put anything on the Table without my permission. *(Interruptions).* I know that if it is regarding Tamil Nadu, nothing can be heard. *(Interruptions)* What is the matter? I cannot understand.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, the law and order problem is worse in Tamil Nadu.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When we discuss Tamil Nadu, I cannot understand anything. What are you talking?

(Interruptions)

Let the Minister reply. *(Interruptions)* Hon. Members, if I cannot understand anything, I am sure the Reporters cannot understand, and the Reporters whom you want your voice and your opinion to be heard cannot understand. So, why can't you have order in the House? *(Interruptions)* Please take your seats.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Am 1 to understand that the Leader of the Opposition has Withdrawn his remarks? If the Leader of the Opposition has not withdrawn his remarks, then I should get a chance to reply.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: 1 never made any remarks against your Ministry. -

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI; Please listen to me,

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Please tel) me what is the remark.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Let me point out.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER; Mr. Minister, I have never made any remarks against your Ministry. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Why are. you 'shutting me out? *J.iterruptions).*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is against the Government. And he has got a right to reply...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER; All kinds of rumours are floating.. .

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Anybody can reply on behalf of the Government. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I have not said anything against his Ministry.. . *(Interruptions)* I have said 'something about the Government. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY; Your colleagues are not interested in the debate. Your colleagues are only interested in disrupting the proceedings of the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Madam, I only confine myself to the Ministry. *(Interruptions)* Madam, I will confine to any Ministry and I will got to out of it.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Dinesh Goswami, I have no allegations against your Ministry.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI; Madam,' two points have been made regarding the independence ot the Judiciary. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please.

SHRr DINESH GOSWAMI: Two points have been made on which, I feel, my Ministry is concerned. And I have a right to reply. The first point is... *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Kesriji, when he got up, you were not here. I marked the time. *(Interruptions)* I will allow you to speak. I have given you my word. I am allowing him to speak. But you please allow him to speak. *(Interruptions)* This is a different matter. This does not concern Tamil Nadu. Please sit down.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: The first allegation made is that there is a rumour that Mr. Pradhan is going to be a High Court Judge. And that concerns my Ministry. Is it the case of Mr. Shiv Shanker that this does not concern my Ministry? .< C. iii >

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Regretfully, all kinds of rumours are floating.

SHRl DINESH GOSWAMI; Let me reply. I am entitled *to* set the rumour at rest. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dinesh Goswami, could you please take your seat for a minute? Thank you. Mr. Kesri, I put before you a proposal. I will permit you to speak provided you allow Mr. Dinesh Goswami and the Minister of State for Home to be heard in rapt silence as I permitted Mr. Shiv Shanker to be heard in rapt silence. 1 request you. I need your co-operation. 1 will allow you to speak. You can make your point. I have no objection. You are a Member of this House. I have sympathy for all the Members of this House. I allowed Mr. Shiv Shanker to make his point and nobody interrupted him. I will allow you to speak provided you give a word to the Chair and to the House that you will listen to the Minister. You may agree or you may not agree, but please allow him to speak. Let him speak.

श्री सीताराम केसरी : एक बात, क्या कभी आज तक इस तरह की कंडीशन किसी माननीय सदस्य के सामने रखी गई ...(व्यवधान) कभी यह परम्परा रही है। एक परम्परा की बात है ...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; **You** come to my Chamber and talk to me *(Interruptions)*.

SHRl SITARAM KESRI: Madam, I seek your protection.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right, you can speak. I have no objection.

श्री सीताराम केसरी : ऐसा मत कहिए।

उपसभापति : आप बोलिए । मुझे ऐतराज नहीं है।

I want to run the House with the co-operation of all. if you do not co-ope-rate in running the House, you are free to speak what you like. I have no objection. You speak. *(Interruptions)*

ठीक है, बोलिए केसरी जी। आप बोलिए।

श्री सीताराम केसरी : यह तरीका गलत है। आपने प्रामिज किया कि दीपेन घोष जी के बाद आप मुझे बुलायेंगी।

उपसभापति : केसरी जी आप बोलिए आप दूसरों को बोलने नहीं देंगे। आप तो बोल ही दीजिए।

You speak. You may not allow anybody else. I am allowing you to speak. You have my permission. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI DINESH GASWAMI: Madam, you have allowed me *to* speak first. How can you allow anybody else? *(Interruptions)* How can I be prevented from speaking? Kindly listen to me *Grst.(ln-terruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Goswami, my job is to listen to you, listen to him and to the other hon. Members. If they do not want to hear you, I am not bothered. I can hear you. You have a right to be heard. I will listen to you. I will permit you. (/n-*terruptions)*

SHRl SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, you called the Minister first. *{Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He will complete. Let me restore some order first. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: I want to hear Mr. Dinesh Goswami first.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us decide who wants to listen to whom. I will put it to the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Mr. Dinesh Goswami wants to clarify in regard to the rumour that Mr. Pradhan is being appointed as a High Court Judge. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: The Leader of the Opposition has conceded my right to reply in regard to the rumour. Let me at least set that rumour at test. *(Interruptions)* I would like to know whether the Leader of the Opposition would control his Members or not? *(Interruptions)* There are two points which he made. I will confine myself only to those two points. I will not go beyond that. *(Interruptions)*

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : वी०पी० सिंह को बुला लीजिए। उनकी सुन लेंगे।...(व्यवधान)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Unless we listen to the Government, how can we know? *(Interruptions)* Let us close this subject. Let us hear what Mr. Goswami wants to say. *(Interruptions).*

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : सी०बी०आई० से संबंधित मामला है, जुडीशियरी से संबंधित मामला है...(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : ये जुडीशियरी पर ही तो बोलने जा रहे हैं। दिनेश गोस्वामी जी जुडीशियरी के बारे में बोलने जा रहे हैं। आप उनकी तो बात सुन लेने दीजिए (व्यवधान) सी०बी०आई० की बात बाद में करेंगे। जुडीशियरी पर बोलने दीजिए। आपने कहा जुडीशियरी का मामला है तो उन्हें बोलने तो दीजिए...(व्यवधान) वह उसके बाद होगा। एक तो सुनिए, आधी बात तो सुनिए। आप तो किसी की भी नहीं सुन रहे हैं।

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Who is the father-in-law of Mr. Sanjay Singh? We want to... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Madam I want to respond to the two points which lhave been made. I must be permitted to respond to the two points. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY; Don't bring in any father-in-law or son-in-law here. We are all Members of Parliament, *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA; we have to hear from the father-in-law of Mr. Sanjay Singh. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: You are also the father of Some son. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Don't bring in relationships here. We are discussing a serious thing. *(Interruptions)* Let Mr. Dinesh Goswami make his points. Let him speak, *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: No,

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who are you to say 'No'? It is for me to say 'No'. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH; Madam, it cannot go on like this. *(Interruptions').*

उपसभापति : बोलिये, आप बोलिए।

(Interruptions).

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: 1 am not going to speak like this. *(Interruptions)* .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you do not want to listen to the Chair, it is entirely up to you, I have no objec-, tion. If you do not abide by the ruling of the Chair, you are free to do what you like, I have no objection. It is entirely up to the House to behave... *(Interruptions)* .

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : आपको धिक्कार है . . . (व्यवधान) आपकी सरकार को धिक्कार है। . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री सुबोध कांत सहाय : शर्म करो। यह * आपके नेता हो गये* *आपके नेता हो जायेंगे, *. . . (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The Leader of the Opposition had made a charge against the Government and the Government must be heard. Any Member of the opposition cannot have the prerogative to say which Minister of the Government to speak. It is the prerogative of the Chair. When you asked from the Chair that let the Minister be heard, we have heard an opposition Member having said 'no'. That Member should be expelled from the House. That Member cannot he allowed to hold the House to ransom. That Member cannot hold the House to ransom.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: You expel the entire opposition. Why do you want to expel one Member of the opposition? *{Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Two wrongs cannot become right. If you fed that it was right or wrong, if you subscribe to that, O.K., agreed. If you think that it was wrong, it is wrong. *{Interruptions)* .

. SHRI A. G. KULKARNI. Madam, the House has gone to such a depth that no worthwhile discussion can take place. It is reprehensible to call somebody's father-in-law or mother-in-laW but I would request Shrj Shiv Shanker lo see that the House is brought to order.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा) : महोदया, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है . . . (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In the House the Chair is supreme, I suppose,

♦Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

but nobody listens to the Chair. *(Interruptions)* .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I would suggest that Shri Shiv Shanker should tender his resignation from the post of Leader of the Opposition. He lias absolutely no control over his members. (He has no control over the two members. If he has any sense of dignity he should resign. Shri Shiv Shanker amd Shri Salve, both should resign... *{Interruptions)* because they have no control over their members.

श्री सीताराम केसरी : आप अपना कंट्रोल कीजिए, अपना । . . . (व्यवधान)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: They cannot sit there as Leaders of the Opposition. It is a matter of great shame for them. What have they been reduced to? They are being held as hostages by a few members of their party. *{Interruptions).* What a shame? How can this House ruin? *(Interruptions)* . If you cannot control your two members, Mr. Shiv Shanker and Mr. Salve, you should quit. If you cannot control your two members of your party, you should quit.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If the Members want to throw away all the principles and norms of the House, it is up to them, to do so. They themselves have formed the rules,

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: You see that the rules are followed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am following them.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: How?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: By asking you and everybody to sit down and allow the Minister to speak.

SHRI SITARAM .KESRI :[s] Madam, you have already promised that after Shri Dipen Ghosh, you will allow me to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kesri, I have put the proposition before you. You do [no]t allow the Minister to speak. You are the Whip in this House. You know how to run this House.

SHRI SITARAM KESRI: I do not want to obstruct the proceedings of the House. Since iyoui promised\ that after Shri Dipen Ghosh, you will allo$_w$ me to speak, this is my only submission.

SHRl A. G. KULKARNI: Why don't you allo$_w$ him to speak?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I allowed him. He is spea^in^ other things. There were many people $_w$ho wanted to speak I promised that I will allo$_w$ him or anybody to speak provided there is peace in the House. I cannot allow the House to run like this.

उपसभापति : आपका प्वांइट आफ आर्डर क्या हैं ?

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : उपसभापति महोदया, राज्य सभा के प्रक्रिया तथा कार्य संचालन विषयक नियम के नियम 259 के तहत मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है । उपसभापति जी, मैं इस सदन की बिल्कुल नई चुनी हुई सदस्या हूं।... **(व्यवधान)**

एक माननीय सदस्य : क्या बात है? ... **(व्यवधान)**

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : महोदया, सोचती थी किसी प्रमुख विषय पर कह करके मैं इस सदन में अपने बोलने की शुरूआत करूंगी लेकिन बहुत दुर्भाग्य पूर्ण प्रसंग के ऊपर इस सदन में मुझे अपना मुंह खोलना पड़ रहा है । महोदया, हम लोग पता नहीं कितनी-कितनी आशायें ले करके यहां आये थे । क्या-क्या सुन करके इस सदन में आये थे । यह सदन देश की सर्वोच्च विधायिका है और उसमें भी हाउस आफ एल्डर्ज यानि राज्य सभा में बहुत संजीदगी से बहस होती है, बहुत संजीदगी से विधायी कार्य होता है । महोदया, मुझे कहना पड़ता हैं । ... **(व्यवधान)** महोदया, मैंने सुना था और पढ़ा है.. **(व्यवधान)**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have permitted her to speak _____Mr. Ahluwa lia, you take your seat. I have allowed her to speak. Sit down_____ Take your seat.... I have permitted her.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : महोदया, जब सदन में कोई व्यक्ति.. **(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : आप किस के बारे में बोल रही हैं ?

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मैं नियम 259 के तहत बोल रही हूं, हमने यह सुना था कि इस सदन में जब कोई सदस्य पहली बार बोलता हैं तो इस सदन की यह गौरवशाली परम्परा है कि उस पर कोई टोकाटाकी नही होती है । मैं अपेक्षा करती हूं उमीद करती हूं कि सदन आज भी इस गौरमामयी परंपरा का पालन करेगा । महोदया, मैं आपसे कहना चाहती हूं.. **(व्यवधान)** महोदया , संसद का एक प्रमुख काम विधायी कार्य होता है और पिछले एक सप्ताह से पांच बिल एजेंडा पर आ रहे हैं लेकिन रोज अगले-अगले दिन के लिये वे बिल सरका दिये जाते हैं । आज तक एक भी बिल पर चर्चा प्रारंभ नहीं हुई उसको पास करना तो दूर की बात है । मैं नियम 259 का हवाला करते हुये आपसे यह प्रार्थना करना चाहती हूं कि यह नियम मेनटीनेंस आफ आर्डर यानि इस सदन में व्यवस्था से संबंधित है । यह नियम तय करता है :

The Chairman shall preserve order and shall have all powers neeessary for the purpose of enforcing his decisions. मैं आपसे कहना चाहती हूं कि अगर

इस सदन के चार लोग यह तय कर लेंगे कि हाउस को चलने नहीं देना है तो क्या हाउस नहीं चलेगा ? पिछले एक सप्ताह से हम लोग तैयारी कर रहे हैं कोई लेजिस्लेटिव बिजनैस आयेगा, उसके ऊपर हम अपनी बात कहेंगे । आज बर्कर्ज पार्टिसिपेशन इन मैनेजमेंट जैसा प्रमुख विषय का बिल है । . . . (व्यवधान) नेशनल कमीशन आन विमेन जैसा एक प्रमुख विधायी कार्य है । दो-दो मंत्रियों ने वक्तव्य देने हैं और उन पर स्पष्टीकरण भी आने हैं । मैं आपसे कहना चाहती हूं कि आप असहायता क्यों जताती हैं ? आप ख्वामख्वाह क्यों बहस करती हैं, आप कहती हैं । if they do not want to listen to me, how am I bothered? नहीं, आपको यह किताब तरह-तरह की शक्तियां प्रदान करती हैं इस सदन में व्यवस्था बनाये रखने के लिये ।

उपसभापति : आप बैठिये, मंत्री जी बोलिये । आप प्लीज, टेक युअर सीट । . . . (**व्यवधान**) मैंने आपकी बात सुन ली ।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : आप उन शक्तियों का प्रयोग कीजिये और सदन की व्यवस्था को बनाये रखिये ।

उपसभापति : आप बैठिये ।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : हम जैसे सदस्यों को निराशा हो रही है । महोदया, इस निराशा को मत बढ़ने दीजिये . . (**व्यवधान**) सदन को चलने दीजिये . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . ताकि जो प्रमुख विधायी कार्य है, संसद का, वह किया जा सके । प्रमुख विधायी कार्य के लिये आप केवल एक-एक घंटा रखती हैं, समय का अभाव बताते हुये और सारा विधान कार्य गौण हो जाता है और बेकार की चीजों पर घंटों-घंटों खर्च किये जाते हैं । . . . (**व्यवधान**) . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned for lunch for one hour.

The House then adjourned for lunch at thirty-one minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-two minutes past two of the clock,

[The Vice-Chairman (Prof. Chandresh P. Thakur) in the Chair]

SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (GENERAL), 1990-91 (AUGUST, 1990)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Supplementary Demands for Grants,

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : केसरी जी का पहले है ।

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (Rajasthan): A point of order, Sir. (*Interruptions*)

वित्त मंत्री (प्रो० मधु दण्डवते) : केसरी जी, एक मिनिट में खतम कर देता हूं । इतनी तो कृपा करें हम लोगों पर । हमारी डिमांड इतनी है बस ।

श्री सीताराम केसरी (बिहार) : ठीक है ।

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a statement (in English and Hindi) showing the Supplementary Demands for Grants (General) for the year 1990-91 (August, 1990).

Thank you, Kesriji.

ALLEGED INTERFERENCE WITH THE JUDICIAL PROCESS IN THE SYED MODI MURDER CASE —*Contd.*

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Sir, I have to respond to two points made by. . .

श्री सीताराम केसरी : देखिये, चेयर की तरफ से यह कमिटमेंट हुआ था कि दीपेन घोष जी के बाद मुझे बोलने दिया जावेगा और उन्होंने मुझे बुलाया भी था, मगर इसी बीच में हंगामे में फिर हाउस एडजोर्न हो गया । इसलिये मेरा आपसे निवेदन है कि चेयर का जो